

Studien zur Theorie und Empirie der Demokratie

Christine Chwaszcza

Migration, Citizenship, and Democracy



Nomos

Studien zur Theorie und Empirie der Demokratie

edited by

Prof. (apl.) Dr. Markus Linden

Prof. Dr. Winfried Thaa

Christine Chwaszcza

Migration, Citizenship, and Democracy



Nomos

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

ISBN 978-3-8487-8367-0 (Print)
978-3-7489-2759-4 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-8367-0 (Print)
978-3-7489-2759-4 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Chwaszcza, Christine
Migration, Citizenship, and Democracy
Christine Chwaszcza
224 pp.
Includes bibliographic references and index.

ISBN 978-3-8487-8367-0 (Print)
978-3-7489-2759-4 (ePDF)



Onlineversion
Nomos eLibrary

1st Edition 2021

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2021. Overall responsibility for manufacturing (printing and production) lies with Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

Table of Contents

Introduction	11
The Topic of the Book	11
Overview	14
A Preemptory Remark	18
Acknowledgments	19
Chapter 1. The Main Theoretical Building Blocks	20
1.1. Citizenship: The General Idea of a Rule-based Account	20
1.2. Ordinary Language Philosophy and Conceptual Analysis	22
1.2.1. The Concept of a Social Practice	23
1.2.2. “Rules” and Normativity in Human Agency	25
1.2.3. Two Problems of Rule-following	26
1.2.4. The Normative Justification of Social Institutions	30
1.2.5. A Few Caveats	32
1.3. Voluntary Migration as a Transnational Phenomenon	32
1.4. The Normative Framework: Philosophical Liberalism	35
Chapter 2. State Citizenship and Transnational Justice	40
2.1. Why Birthright Citizenship is Not a Fact: The First Objection to Carens	41
2.1.1. Birthright Citizenship as State Citizenship	43
2.1.2. State Citizenship and the Universal Right to Citizenship	44
2.1.3. Involuntary Citizenship: A Normative Justification	45
(1) Consent-based Accounts of Political Association	47
(2) Voluntary-exchange-based Accounts of Political Association	49
(3) Justice-based Accounts of Political Association	50
2.1.4. The Procedural Element in a Rule-based Account of Citizenship	51

Table of Contents

2.2.	Political Agency and the Limits of Cosmopolitan Consequentialism: The Second Objection to Carens	52
2.2.1.	The Theoretical Relevance of Political Agency	54
2.2.2.	The Normative Relevance of Political Agency	56
2.2.3.	Non-ideal Theory: Why Consequences are Not All that Matters	57
Chapter 3.	Migration as a Problem of Transnational Justice: The Moral Status of Individuals and Societies	60
3.1.	Is There an Individual (Human) Right to Free Movement Across Borders?	62
3.2.	Beyond Claim Rights: Freedom of Migration as a Requirement of Transnational Justice	64
3.3.	The Competitive Nature of Current Migration Dynamics	66
3.4.	A Criticism of Normative Reductionism I: Ethical Individualism and the Moral Standing of Persons in Institutional Contexts	69
3.4.1.	Methodological Individualism in Contractarian Theories of Global Justice	70
3.4.2.	Ethical Individualism and the Holistic Nature of Social Institutions	75
3.4.3.	The Idea of Government by Authorization: A Non- voluntaristic Interpretation	77
3.4.4.	A First Interim Conclusion	78
3.5.	A Criticism of Normative Reductionism II: How to Reconcile Universalistic and Particularistic Conceptions of Justice	78
3.5.1.	Goodin's Argument against Moral Particularism	79
3.5.2.	Political Philosophy without Politics? – A Criticism of Goodin	80
3.5.3.	Political Agency as a <i>sui generis</i> Source of Sociopolitical Justice: A Defense	82
3.5.4.	A Second Interim Conclusion	84
3.6.	The Moral Standing of Societies	84
3.6.1.	Societies as Spaces of Political Agency	84
3.6.2.	Societies as Bearers of a Right to Collective Self- determination	86
3.6.3.	Societies as Addressees of Collective Responsibility	87
3.6.4.	A Third Interim Conclusion	89

3.7. Summing up: Transnational Justice and Normative Assessments of Rules of Inclusion and Exclusion	89
3.8. Beyond the Model of the Nation State: Internationalism or Transnationalism?	91
Chapter 4. Normative Particularism Without Nationalism or Statism: A Liberal-democratic Account	94
4.1. Miller's Liberal Nationalism: A Constructive Criticism	95
4.1.1. A Brief Outline of Miller's Argument for Liberal Nationalism	95
4.1.2. National Integration and the Development of the Model of the Social State	97
4.1.3. A Counter-thesis: Democratic Legitimacy vs. Liberal Nationalism	98
4.2. State Sovereignty and Normative Particularism: A Criticism of Blake's Argument from Coercion	100
4.2.1. Blake on Citizenship and Coercion	100
4.2.2. Beyond Coercion: Political Sovereignty Bottom-up rather than Top-down	101
Chapter 5. Pure Procedural Justice and Democratic Legitimacy	103
5.1. Democratic Legitimacy and the "All Affected Persons" Principle	105
5.2. Democracy as a Mechanism of Pure Procedural Justice: An Outline	106
5.3. The Moral Point of Democracy	107
5.4. Democratic Legitimacy as a Social Practice	111
5.5. The Idea of Transnational Democracy in Light of the Practical Pre-conditions of Democratic Legitimacy	112
5.6. The Limits of Metaethical Proceduralism: A Criticism of Discourse Ethics	113
Chapter 6. Citizenship and Immigration from a Transnational Moral Point of View	116
6.1. Impartiality as a Standard of Moral Justification	119
6.1.1. Practical Reasons	120
6.1.2. Moral Reasons	121

Table of Contents

6.1.3. Impartiality and the Construction of a Moral Point of View	123
6.1.4. Normative Reasoning	124
6.2. Requirements of Fairness concerning Different Groups of Migrants	125
6.2.1. Equal Respect: Why the Least Well Off Should Not Always Have Priority	125
6.2.2. The Moral Status of Voluntary Migrants: A Justice-based Criticism of Miller	128
6.2.3. The Deficiency of Arguments from Emergency	129
6.3. Three Standards for the Settlement of Conflicts of Morally Substantive Claims and Justified Interests	132
6.4. Fairness of Access: A Preliminary Conclusion	135
Chapter 7. Migration and Selective Exclusion from Democratic Citizenship	136
7.1. The Case Against Discrimination	137
7.2. Democratic Citizenship and Justified Discrimination	138
7.2.1. Discrimination on the Basis of Religious Belief	139
(1) Three Caveats	139
(2) What is at Stake? The Moral Weight of Freedom of Religion in Arguments for Democratic Inclusion	141
(3) The Moral Difference between Citizens and Non-citizen Residents	146
7.2.2. Discrimination on the Basis of Political Beliefs	147
7.3. Discrimination from the Perspective of Different Groups of Potential Migrants	148
7.4. Citizenship Tests	149
7.5. A Short Remark on Group-discrimination on the Basis of Special Historical Relations	152
Chapter 8. Residence and Democratic Inclusion	154
8.1. Do Immigrants Have a Duty to Naturalize?	155
8.2. Walzer on Social Integration, Community, and Citizenship	159
8.3. Rubio-Marín on Immigration and Democratic Inclusion	162

8.4. Partial and Multiple-layered Citizenship: Bauböck's Stakeholder Argument for Democratic Inclusion	163
8.5. Beyond Residence: Challenges to Transnational Citizenship	165
8.5.1. Dual or Multiple Citizenship	165
8.5.2. Illegal Immigration and the Normative Weight of <i>de facto</i> Social Integration	167
Chapter 9. Family Migration: A Transnational Perspective	171
9.1. Exposition of Two Problems	172
9.1.1. The Family as a Social Institution	172
9.1.2. The Protection of the Family in International Human Rights Documents	173
9.1.3. Transnational Social Pluralism and Transnational Legal Pluralism	175
9.2. Who is Authorized to Define the Institution of the Family?	176
9.3. Polygamy in Practice	178
9.4. Polygamy in Normative Debates concerning Immigration and Women's Rights	182
9.5. Immigration and Transnational Legal Pluralism: Some Principled Objections	183
9.6. A Brief Remark concerning the Normative Weight of Personal Preferences	186
9.7. Beyond Access: Liberal Limits of Transnational Legal Pluralism with Respect to Foreign Residents	187
9.8. Family-based Immigration and Requirements of Fairness among Different Groups of Immigrants	189
9.8.1. Access	190
9.8.2. Naturalization and Democratic Inclusion	191
9.9. A (Very) Preliminary Conclusion	191
Chapter 10. Society and Culture: A Plea for Pluriculturalism	193
10.1. "Multiculturalism": Conceptual Sense and Nonsense	194
10.2. Culturalism as a Normative Social Ideal	197
10.3. Culturalism as a Descriptive Analysis of Individual and Social Identity	198
10.3.1. A Criticism of Cultural Identity Concepts	198

Table of Contents

10.3.2. The Difference between Culturalism and a Practice Account	200
10.3.3. The Methodological Background of Early Culturalism Debates	202
10.3.4. The Practice Account as a Methodological Alternative to Culturalism	203
10.4. A Reassessment of the Value of Cultural Belonging	204
10.5. Pluriculturalism: A Liberal-democratic Proposal	206
10.6. A Final Thought	210
Bibliography	212
Name Index	223